

BRISTOL OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY

Report of the Scrutiny Inquiry Day

The Case for Culture:

'How can we support Bristol's cultural sector to continue to grow and flourish?'

Conclusions of the Place Scrutiny Commission, December 2015

1. Executive Summary

Bristol City Council's Scrutiny function is responsible for helping to develop innovative policies by exploring, with key stakeholders, areas of priority for the city and developing recommendations to the Mayor to feed into corporate priorities.

On the 10th December 2015 the Place Scrutiny Commission held an Inquiry Day to consider 'The Case for Culture' and make recommendations on 'How can we support Bristol's cultural sector to continue to grow and flourish?'

Invitees included a range of the city's cultural providers and organisations, academics, the relevant senior council officers and all elected members in the city. The full attendance list for the event can be found at Appendix 1. The Inquiry Day was chaired by the Chair of Place Scrutiny Commission, Councillor Charlie Bolton.

The key questions that the Inquiry sought to explore were as follows:

- How can the growth of culture be maintained in Bristol?
- What are the options for ensuring best return on investment?
- Which areas should a refreshed city-wide cultural strategy focus upon?

The overall consensus from those who attended the inquiry was that 'culturally' Bristol is currently thriving, has much to be proud of, and should celebrate its success to date. Bristol is now regarded alongside cities such as Manchester and Liverpool for its strong and unique cultural offer and is gaining a reputation internationally as a cultural destination.

However, observations were also made about being cautious and that the city should not 'rest on its laurels' and there were many suggestions of areas where there was 'room for improvement'.

In a period of 'austerity' and the associated budgetary constraints difficult decisions are required by local authorities on service provision and the delivery and/or enabling of the cultural sector has been called into question. The Autumn Statement 2015 and Comprehensive Spending Revenue however set out a very clear direction of travel placing a high priority on income generation and business rate generation for local authorities of which culture is undoubtedly part of the overall offer that makes cities like Bristol attractive for businesses and employees.

This year Bristol is a Learning City and this presents further opportunities for ensuring there is a coordinated approach to creating and promoting learning opportunities for everyone, of all ages and from all communities, in all parts of the city. The Culture Team at BCC are actively involved in the Learning City initiative and are continuing to support both formal and informal learning opportunities.

Culture provides 3% of all employment in Bristol and it's calculated that it generated £262.4million Gross Value Added (GVA) to the local economy in 2011. Statistics such as these, coupled with research that links culture to improved levels of wellbeing and community cohesion provide a strong case for its necessity.

However, the question of 'How can we support Bristol's cultural sector to continue to grow and flourish?' generated a large quantity of discussion points and recommendations to be considered.

The full list recommendations and key discussion points from the Inquiry can be found in section 4 of this report, but the key recommendations can be summarised as follows;

Key Recommendations

Recognise the value of Bristol's 'cultural offer' (in all its forms) and the vibrancy of economic wellbeing of the City. As such we believe funding for Bristol's cultural offer should be maintained in so far as it's possible in the current economic climate.

- 1. **Define the role of Bristol City Council (BCC):** It was recommended that the most helpful role for BCC in future would be as a facilitator/enabler/broker; helping to connect different providers and projects.
- 2. **Geography and Mobility:** currently the majority of cultural activities are located centrally and steps should be taken to transfer more cultural events out of the centre and into the wider city areas.

To achieve full outreach into areas, particularly those with high levels of deprivation, there should to be a multi-stakeholder approach to a revamped cultural strategy between the local authority, cultural sector, VCS organisations and schools etc and longer-term investment plans to widen opportunities for all.

- 3. **Physical Spaces:** There is a need to look holistically at premises and public spaces across the city and thinking about how they could be used more creatively.
- 4. Benefits and Investments: there is a need to ensure that both the economic benefits and improved levels of wellbeing that 'culture' in all its different forms could help to deliver are promoted. But it was recommended that Bristol needs new approaches to generate additional funding for cultural projects and activities in the future. Opinions were varied about how this should be achieved.

5. Key Recommendations for a Revamped Cultural Strategy

Connectivity: A revised cultural strategy should focus on improving communication and connectivity to enable better coordination between cultural/arts organisations/projects and educational establishments in order to bridge the gaps and make provision more accessible to all. It was suggested that BCC should be responsible for facilitating a 'collective vision' with stakeholders.

Inclusivity and Diversity: It was recommended that a newly developed cultural strategy should be developed to assist community cohesion and intercultural understanding and should encourage activities and projects that help increase social interaction between different groups.

Identity: It was suggested that as a destination, Bristol needed to keep its 'cultural offer' fresh, exciting and innovative to continue attracting local, national and international

audiences. Bristol should continually promote aspects of its uniqueness. This could include embracing the negative or taboo aspects of its history and using them to achieve positive outcomes.

Learning and development: The Inquiry Day highlighted the significant connections between lifelong learning, personal development and culture.

Major and Minor Cultural Expressions: The Inquiry concluded that large cultural events were essential for a city the size of Bristol but investing in the smaller, 'grass-roots' community based cultural activities was equally important. The city could become a victim of its own success if it followed a path of focussing only on the major elements, as without the constant development of talent and expertise, the city could be left with needing to buy in talent, losing its cultural uniqueness in the process.

2. The Inquiry Day

What is a Scrutiny Inquiry Day?

Scrutiny Inquiry Days enable Councillors to acquire an understanding of complex issues by hearing from expert speakers and engaging in debate with specialists, with the objective of identifying well-informed evidence-based recommendations. Inquiry Days aim to create a balance between information sharing and discussion, thus allowing the broad range of views to be heard, and enabling participants to share their particular perspective.

The format for the day consisted of a combination of local and national speakers and included questions and answers sessions, table discussions/workshop and a plenary feedback at the end of the day. The full programme for the day can be found at Appendix 2.

The following leading providers and practitioners attended to share their knowledge and expertise;

- Phil Gibby, Arts Council England
- Helen Manchester, University of Bristol
- Matt Little, Real Ideas Organisation
- Dick Penny, Watershed and Shamil Ahmed, Rife Magazine
- John Hirst, Destination Bristol
- Franco Bianchini, Professor of Cultural Policy & Planning at Leeds Beckett University
- Alex Homfray, Director of BOP Consulting
- Laura Pve, Service Manager for Culture, BCC
- Emma Harvey, Trinity Centre
- Roger Griffith, Ujima Radio
- Helen Legg, Spike Island
- Melissa Inman, Arts & Events Manager, BCC

Where speakers provided slides to accompany their talks, they can be found at Appendix 3.

3. Background and Context

It has been said that culture is 'notoriously difficult to define but impossible to ignore'. So in order to have a clear focus the Inquiry Day explored the following key areas:

- what Bristol as a city does culturally, how we do it and why we do it
- how successful Bristol is as a cultural entity
- how growth and development can be maintained in the cultural sector
- our local strategy and evaluate its effectiveness
- how other key partners in the cultural sector can be supported
- how effective are other core city's approaches to culture and if/what we can learn from them
- where local investment is best targeted and why
- how and whether a broader range of cultural diversity should and could be encouraged

The main objectives of the Inquiry Day were:

- To evaluate the city's strategic approach to culture
- To understand the city's return on investment into cultural activities
- Provide a clear picture of where investments are best targeted during a time of limited funds

Key questions that the Inquiry is sought to answer:

- How can the growth of culture be maintained in Bristol?
- What are the options for ensuring best return on investment?
- Which areas should a refreshed city-wide cultural strategy focus upon?

To ensure the Inquiry achieved the key aims and objectives the day was structured around the following themes (a full copy of the programme can be found in Appendix 2):

- a holistic view of culture
- nurturing talent in the creative industries
- culture education and young people
- culture, tourism and Bristol's identity
- cultural policy and city cultural strategies
- culture and the national picture
- Bristol's approach

Background Papers

An information pack was provided to all attendees in advance of the event, which included a broad range of relevant background reports to help delegates to prepare. The papers detailed key facts and figures regarding current BCC funding, visitor numbers, events and recent developments, current cultural strategies for Bristol and other cities and a copy of the recently published UK Cities Culture Report 2015. The full papers can be found here;

4. Key Discussion Points and Recommendations

The overall consensus from those who attended the inquiry was that 'culturally' Bristol was currently thriving, had much to be proud of and should celebrate its success to date. It was now highly regarded nationally alongside cities such as Manchester and Liverpool and was also gaining an international reputation.

However, observations were also made about being 'cautious' and that Bristol should not 'rest on its laurels' and there were many suggestions of areas where there was 'room for improvement'.

On the day, the 'case for culture' in itself appeared to be fairly unproblematic to justify. The cultural and creative Industries were a distinctive and increasingly important dimension of the West of England (WoE) economy and the fastest growing sector in the UK economy. Bristol City Council spends comparatively less on culture than many other local authorities, but interestingly had the strongest creative industries sector of any large urban area in the UK in 2014. Culture provided 3% of all employment in Bristol and generated an estimated £262.4million Gross Value Added (GVA) to the local economy in 2011. Statistics such as these, coupled with research that strongly linked culture to improved levels of wellbeing and community cohesion provided a solid case for continual or even increased investment.

Nevertheless, there was consensus that there was more that could be done to enable the cultural sector to thrive and the Inquiry Day examined this in detail. Delegates were asked to consider, in groups, one of the two of the following questions:

- How can the growth of culture be maintained in Bristol?
 - Is Bristol getting it right?
 - What can we learn from other cities?
- Which areas should a refreshed city-wide cultural strategy focus on?

Key discussion points and recommendations from each of the tables have been collated and grouped together as follows:

Defining the role of Bristol City Council: The inquiry made a number of comments and recommendations about the role of Bristol City Council with regards to culture, with a number of delegates suggesting that the role of BCC needed to be clarified or re-defined. It was strongly suggested that the most helpful role for BCC to undertake would be as a facilitator / enabler / broker; helping to connect different providers and projects i.e. connecting smaller developing projects with larger more established organisations which would benefit them both greatly.

Recommendations for BCC were as follows:

 R1: Map what's happening, identify the gaps and identify a plan for creating the bridges between them

- R2: Utilise what existing information the Council had to produce a map of all
 activities and facilities in the city including schools etc to identify a plan for future
 engagement and promotion
- R3: Increase connections between cultural /arts organisations and educational establishments/sector to make provision more accessible to all
- R4: Utilise ward councillors more as they could help open doors in communities and start conversations

Geography and Mobility: The Inquiry highlighted that currently the majority of cultural activities were located centrally and a perception that in some parts of Bristol there was almost a complete absence of cultural activities, events, facilities or infrastructure. This coupled with the cost of travel across the city prohibited some people from participating in cultural events and activities, particularly young people. Recommendations to address this were suggested as follows:

- R5: Steps should be taken to transfer more cultural events out of the centre to other
 parts of the city and thus expose people to new activities and enable perceptions
 that Bristol is 'your' city
- R6: Introduce measures to help support movement around the city for some groups. E.g. free public transport for those aged 16 years and under

To achieve full outreach into deprived areas, there needed to be a multi-stakeholder approach between the local authority, cultural sector, VCS organisations and schools etc and longer-term investment plans to widen opportunities for all.

Physical Spaces: The Inquiry Day highlighted the importance of looking holistically at premises and public spaces across the city and thinking about how they could be used differently and more creatively. This was combined with the suggestion that there were currently many groups from across the city that required access to affordable space to be able to continue and develop. Some recommendations were as follows:

- R7: The Council should consider how it works with communities and organisation to
 make the best use of empty buildings particularly those out of the centre for
 arts/cultural activities. This could be applied to the council's own property portfolio but
 also for the council to encourage the best use of buildings/spaces within
 communities.
 - R8: Create a variety of suitable spaces both real and digital for arts and culture
 including informal, developmental and welcoming venues where people were able
 to come, spend time, meet new people and be creative. For example; Spike Island
 provided a wide range of formal and informal spaces under one roof: gallery and
 exhibition spaces, workshops, business units, office spaces and a café; and Know
 Your place does the same in the digital sector.
- R9: Encourage more co-inhabited spaces for service users including young people, who were curious of the activities that surround them whilst accessing a service or hangout space. Some examples that were given:

- hang-out spaces for young people situated adjacent to challenging art installations or galleries
- Japan apparently built sheltered housing adjacent to nurseries and schools to improve well being of old people and breakdown barriers between young and old
- Old Fire Station in Oxford; a project where homeless people and the general public spent time together informally, breaking down preconceptions and stereotypes
- R10: Steps should be taken to create more affordable spaces to hire in the outer areas of Bristol and newly regenerated areas where 'collectives' could be creative and local artists and voluntary organisations could engage communities in projects that improved their confidence to take part or even start their own initiatives
- R11: Extend the services that traditional facilities like libraries offered turn them into
 community 'hubs' that included, employment and advice sessions to draw people in
 but also provide arts /creative activities. This aligns to the strategy the council is
 currently pursuing in regards best use of library facilities and also the best use of the
 council's office accommodation.
- R12: Carefully consider the use of public spaces for events that aren't free for all. It
 was suggested that the closure of public spaces for paid for events marginalised the
 less well off in the city and increased the divide between those "culturally included"
 and "culturally excluded".

Benefits and Investments: Culture plays a key role in generating economic growth and prosperity in Bristol. With the annual visitor economy currently estimated at 1.2billion it was in everyone's interest to ensure the cultural sector continued to grow and flourish. Attendees highlighted the importance of promoting both the economic benefits and improved levels of wellbeing that 'culture' in all its different forms could help to deliver.

It was recommended that Bristol needed new approaches to generate additional funding for cultural projects and activities in the future. Some suggestions of how this could be achieved were as follows, although it should be noted that opinions varied about how this could be achieved;

- R13: Consider the creation of additional Business Improvement Districts that could in turn help to promote the cultural offer of different areas
- R14: Officers look into the pros and cons of using discretionary business rates to support non-profit making organisations in the cultural sector. This would help maintain their work in local communities and to help to further some of the Council's corporate objectives
- R15: Officers to look into the pros and cons of a Hotel / Bed Tax; funds could be ring-fenced for cultural events and organisations, for example, a 'holistic arts and culture fund'. This could also help support projects in areas that often fell between 'funding gaps' and allow support to organisations /events that were spontaneous in their delivery.

Inclusivity and Diversity: There was widespread agreement from those who attended that 'culturally' Bristol was very successful. However, the Inquiry concluded that Bristol's cultural sector was still not reaching its full potential because of persistent issues of inequality and the lack of diversity and engagement in some areas. A number of comments suggested that inequalities created barriers that stifled the growth of culture. It was therefore recommended that a newly developed cultural strategy should be developed to assist community cohesion and intercultural understanding and should encourage activities and projects that help increase social interaction between different geographical communities and communities of interest. The recommendations were;

- R16: Support and encourage more cultural projects and activities that help to bridge the gaps between different communities.
- R17: Taking steps to increase audience diversity and encourage people from less affluent backgrounds to participate.
- R18: Introduce measures to increase audience diversity and encourage and support people from less affluent backgrounds and different communities to participate
- R19: Acknowledge that it's not only groups with protected characteristics that didn't engage but generally those who lived in poorer areas who often weren't involved – and identify ways to 'involve everyone'.

Identity: It was suggested that as a destination Bristol needed to keep its 'cultural offer' fresh, exciting and innovative to continue attracting local, national and international audiences.

- R20: Bristol should continually promote aspects of its uniqueness both in the physical
 and digital environments. This includes embracing the negative or taboo aspects of
 its history and trying to achieve something positive from them. It was suggested that
 telling stories through art and culture aided our understanding of 'who we are'. Some
 practical examples of how this might be done were:
 - Projects to engage communities in developing 'image banks' and 'language banks' to help unearth local heritage, customs, and interests. These could be used to kick-start cultural projects that communities will in turn want to engage with because they will be able to identify with them.
 - Have a city-wide arts and crafts invitation to 'show case your work'. This could be promoted through a variety of channels including Neighbourhood Partnerships, with all exhibits in a 'city talent display' in the M Shed and/or museum for a period of time to draw new people in through the doors.

Learning and development: The inquiry highlighted the significant connections between lifelong learning, personal development and culture. It was important to acknowledge that cultural activities and events had a key role to play in enabling communities to experience new ideas and increase their levels of knowledge and understanding and as such build stronger communities. Recommendations that related to this were as follows:

 R21: Given that school curriculums were so jam-packed and the complex nature of getting funding to work within schools, providers should consider the use of afterschool clubs to engage young people in arts creative activities.

- R22: Provide more opportunities which supported formal and informal learning through culture and heritage, enabling everyone to expand and develop their creative knowledge and skills.
- R23: Listen to the voices of children and young people, as artists and creative producers themselves, not just as an audience. 'Room 13' at Hareclive School was sighted by many as an example of good practice as a 'child led artist's studio'
- R24: It was felt that more efforts should be made to listen to the voices of children
 and young people, as artists and creative producers themselves, not just as an
 audience. It was generally agreed that schools and After School Clubs provided the
 best opportunities to address the issue of inequality of access to culture. 'Room 13' at
 Hareclive School as a 'child led artist's studio' was sighted by many as an example of
 good practice.

Major and Minor Cultural Expressions: The Inquiry concluded that large cultural events were essential for a city the size of Bristol but investing in the smaller, 'grass-roots' community based cultural activities were regarded as just as important. It was felt that the major elements were necessary for a successful cultural economy; they generated income, created jobs and enhanced the city's reputation. Investment in these events should not undermine the investment in grass root's events, exhibitions and actions which are expressions of those communities. Whereas the minor elements enabled the generating and nurturing of young talent capable of contributing to the cultural economy. The Inquiry Day recommended that;

• R25: The Cultural Strategy focus on enabling a programme of cultural events that would enable both major and grassroots activities to flourish.

Next Steps

The Place Scrutiny Commission will consider the draft report on 17th March 2016, following which it will be referred to the Mayor at a Cabinet meeting. Where recommendations are accepted by the Mayor, an action plan for implementation will be produced and progress monitored by the Place Scrutiny Commission on a 6 monthly basis.

Lead Members have requested that this report be referred to Full Council for information and discussion. A date for this will be advised in due course.

Appendices

Appendix 1 – Attendance List

Appendix 2 – Inquiry Day Programme

Appendix 3 – Speakers' Presentations

Attendance List

Scrutiny Inquiry Day 10th December 2015 'How can we support Bristol's cultural sector to continue to grow and flourish?'

Councillors

Name	Job Title/Organisation
Charlie Bolton	Councillor, BCC
Claire Hiscott	Councillor, BCC
Steve Pearce	Councillor, BCC
Simon Cook	Councillor, BCC
Craig Cheney	Councillor, BCC
Celia Phipps	Councillor, BCC
Helen Holland	Councillor, BCC
Martin Fodor	Councillor, BCC
Gus Hoyt	Councillor, BCC
Alastair Watson	Councillor, BCC
Sue Milestone	Councillor, BCC
Olly Mead	Councillor, BCC
Mhairi Threlfall	Councillor, BCC
Daniella Radice	Councillor, BCC
Estella Tincknell	Councillor, BCC
Anthony Negus	Councillor, BCC
Deborah Joffe	Councillor, BCC

Other Attendees

Name	Job Title/Organisation
Laura Pye	Service Manager Culture, BCC
Zak Mensah	Head of Transformation, Culture, BCC
Michele Farmer	Service Director for Early Help and Intervention, BCC
Judith Brown	Older People's Forum
Deborah Kinghorn	Policy and Research Adviser, BCC (Facilitator)
Andrea Dell	Service Manager - Policy, Scrutiny, Research &
	Executive Support, BCC
Philip Walker	Engagement, Culture Division, BCC
Barra Mac Ruairi	Strategic Director - Place, BCC
Romayne de Fonseka	Policy Advisor – Scrutiny, BCC (Facilitator)
Lucy Fleming	Scrutiny Co-ordinator, BCC (Facilitator)
Johanna Holmes	Policy Advisor – Scrutiny, BCC
Jon Smith	BCC Public Relations, BCC
Melissa Inman	Arts and Events Manager, BCC
Sam Mahoney	Democratic Services Officer, BCC
Jane Greenaway	Communications and Marketing, BCC (Facilitator)
Martin James	Youth Participation, BCC
Tom Oswald	Executive Office, BCC (Facilitator)
Carolyn Hassan	Knowle West Media Centre
Ray Barnett	Head of Collections and Archives, BCC

George Ferguson	Mayor of Bristol
Alistair Reid	Service Director - Economy, BCC
Louise De Cordova	Democratic Services (Facilitator)
Mohammad-Nassir Miah	Bristol Muslim Cultural Society
Martin Vegoda	Salaam Shalom
Neil Beddow	ACTA
Daryn Carter	Bristol Pride
Ben Hardy	Bristol 2015 & Balloon Fiesta & REM
Tom Morris	Bristol Old Vic
Emma Stenning	Bristol Old Vic
Professor Mike Basker	University of Bristol - Dean of the Faculty of Arts
Rich Warren	Bristol Festivals
Claire Doherty	Arnolfini
Louise Jennings	Associate Dean, Faculty of Arts, Creative Industries and
3.	Education, University of West of England
Sophie Giltinan	Bristol City Youth Council
Pasquale Fasulo	Arts & Media, City of Bristol College
Robin Hague	Learning Partnership West
Sophie Giltinan	BCYC
Carl Fuller	staff with BCYC
Thomas Dunn	1625 Independent People
Narasser Gordon	1625 Independent People
Tim Bleszynski	Arnolfini
Ali Robertson	Tobacco Factory
Julian Davis	Ujima Radio
Angela Higgins	Learning Partnership West
John Hirst	Destination Bristol
Dick Penny	Watershed
Helen Legg	Spike Island
Emma Harvey	Trinity Centre
Roger Griffiths	Ujima Radio
Dr Helen Manchester	University of Bristol
Phil Gibby	Arts Council England
Alex Homfray	Director, BOP Consulting
Professor Franco Bianchini	Professor of Cultural Policy & Planning at Leeds Beckett
	University
Matt Little	
Width Entire	Real Ideas Organisation

Bristol City Council Overview and Scrutiny – Scrutiny Inquiry Day

'How can we support Bristol's cultural sector to continue to grow and flourish?'

Date: Thursday 10th December, 2015

Venue: M Shed, Princes Wharf, Wapping Road, Bristol, BS1 4RN

Time: 9.30am to 3.15pm

Programme

9.00 am	Registration and refreshments
9.30 am	Welcome and Introduction
	 Councillor Charlie Bolton, Chair of the Place Scrutiny Commission – Inquiry Day Chair
9.35 am	A short film 'We are Bristol'
9.40 am	A Holistic View of Culture
	 Phil Gibby - Arts Council England
10.00 am	Teenage Kicks? Exploring cultural value from a youth perspective
	 Dr Helen Manchester - University of Bristol
10.15 am	Education and Culture
	 Matt Little - Real Ideas Organisation
10.30 am	Question and Answers Session
10 40 am 1	10 Minute facilitated table discussion
10.40 alli .	to Milliate facilitated table discussion
	10.50 – 11.00 am - 10 Minute Break
11.00 am	Culture and the Creative Industries

Dick Penny and Shamil Ahmed - Watershed

11.15 am Culture and Sense of Place

♦ John Hirst - Destination Bristol

11.30 am Cultural Policy and City Cultural Strategies

- Professor Franco Bianchini Leeds Beckett University
- 11.50 am Question and Answers Session
- 12.00 pm 15 Minute facilitated table discussion

------ 12.15 – 12.45pm – Lunch & Networking

12.45 pm UK Cities Culture Report 2015

♦ Alex Homfray - Director, BOP Consulting

1.00 pm How Bristol City Council supports the industry

◆ Laura Pye – Service Manager for Culture, BCC

1.15 pm Bristol's approach

- Emma Harvey Trinity Centre
- ♦ Roger Griffith Ujima Radio
- ♦ Helen Legg Spike Island
- ♦ Melissa Inman BCC Arts & Events Manager

1.55 pmCultural Benefits and Return on Investments

Laura Pye – Service Manager for Culture, Bristol City Council

2.15 am Question and Answers Session

2.30 pm **Group Workshops** - Delegates will be asked to consider one of the following questions;

Question 1 - How can the growth of culture be maintained in Bristol?

- -Is Bristol getting it right?
- -What can we learn from other cities?

Question 2 - Which areas should a refreshed city-wide cultural strategy focus on?

- Links to examples from other cities are included in the information pack and will be provided on the day
- 3.00 pm Plenary feedback 2/3 key points from each group & summary of ideas
- 3.10 pm Chairs Closing Comments
 - Councillor Bolton

SPEAKERS' PRESENTATIONS

Below are some of the slides from the speakers' presentations:

- A. Dick Penny Watershed
- B. Franco Bianchini Professor of Cultural Policy & Planning at Leeds Beckett University
- C. Laura Pye Service Manager Culture, Bristol City Council
- D. Helen Legg Director, Spike Island